The Behavioral and Brain Sciences

An International Journal of Current Research and Theory with Open Peer Commentary

ISSN 0140-525X

Editor
Stevan Harnad

Assistant Editor
Helaine Randerson

Associate Editors

Animal Intelligence
David Premack
University of Pennsylvania

Behavioral Biology
Jack P. Hailman
University of Wisconsin

Cognition and Artificial Intelligence
Zenon Pylyshyn
University of Western Ontario

Developmental Psychology
Charles J. Brainerd
University of Western Ontario

Ethology and Neuroethology
John C. Fentress
Dalhousie University

Evolutionary Biology
Michael T. Ghiselin
University of Utah

Experimental Analysis of Behavior
A. Charles Catania
University of Maryland Baltimore County

Higher CNS Function
Robert W. Doty
University of Rochester

History and Systems
Julian Jaynes
Princeton University

Language and Cognition
Peter Wason
University College London

Neurobiology
Graham Hoyle
University of Oregon

Neurophysiology
Barry H. Smith
National Institutes of Health

Neuropsychology
Karl Pribram
Stanford University

Philosophy
Daniel C. Dennett
Tufts University

Psychobiology
David S. Olton
Johns Hopkins University

Volume 3 1980

Cambridge University Press
Cambridge
London New York New Rochelle
Melbourne Sydney
1980

Published by the Press Syndicate of the University of Cambridge
The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge CB2 1RP
32 East 57th Street, New York, NY 10022
296 Beaconsfield Parade, Middle Park, Melbourne 3206

© Cambridge University Press 1980

Printed in the United States of America by Science Press, Ephrata, Pennsylvania

Contents Volume 3 1980

Number 1, March 1980

Target Article

Chomsky, N. Rules and representations 1

Open Peer Commentary

Andor, J. *Some remarks on the notion of competence* 15
Cromer, R. F. *Empirical evidence in support of non-empiricist theories of mind* 16
Cummins, R. and Harnish, R. M. *The language faculty and the interpretation of linguistics* 18
Dennett, D. C. *Passing the buck to biology* 19
Ghiselin, M. T. *Evolutionary anatomy and language* 20
Gottlieb, G. *Elaboration of maturational and experiential contributions to the development of rules and representations* 21
Harman, G. *Two quibbles about analyticity and psychological reality* 21
Hudson, P. T. W. *Minimalism in cognition and language: rich man, poor man* 22
Lakoff, G. *What ever happened to deep structure?* 22
Marshall, J. C. *The new organology* 23
Matthews, R. J. *Language learning* versus *grammar growth* 25
McCawley, J. D. ¡*Tabula si, rasa no!* 26
Moravcsik, J. M. *Chomsky's radical break with modern traditions* 28
Morton, A. *There are many modular theories of mind* 29
Morton, J. *Language: levels of characterisation* 29
Rachlin, H. *Cross purposes* 30
Rollin, B. E. *Innate and* a priori 31
Rosenthal, D. M. *The modularity and maturation of cognitive capacities* 32
Sampson, G. *Chomsky's evidence against Chomsky's theory* 34
Schank, R. C. *An artificial intelligence perspective on Chomsky's view of language* 35
Searle, J. R. *Rules and causation* 37
Sober, E. *Representation and psychological reality* 38
Stich, S. P. *What every speaker cognizes* 39
Van Gulick, R. *Knowledge and learning* 40

Author's Response

Chomsky, N. *The new organology* 42

Target Article

Fodor, J. A. Methodological solipsism considered as a research strategy in cognitive psychology 63

Open Peer Commentary

Block, N. and Bromberger, S. *States' rights* 73
Charniak, E. *Some aspirin for Dasein* 74
Churchland, P. M. *In defense of naturalism* 74
Cohen, L. J. *Some defects in Fodor's 'computational' theory* 75
Cummins, R. *Causes and representation* 76
Davis, L. *On the need for a computational psychology and the hope for a naturalistic one* 76
Dreyfus, H. L. *Dasein's revenge: methodological solipsism as an unsuccessful escape strategy in psychology* 78
Evans, G. *Fodor flawed* 79
Geach, P. T. *Some remarks on representations* 80
Harman, G. *What is methodological solipsism?* 81
Haugeland, J. *Formality and naturalism* 81
Hayes, P. *Knowing about formality* 82
Isard, S. D. *Sensing and reference* 83
Joshi, A. K. *The content of a representation also depends on the procedure interpreting it* 84
Jusczyk, P. W. and Earhard, B. *Implications of Fodor's methodological solipsism for psychological theories* 84
Katz, J. J. *Fodor's guide to cognitive psychology* 85
Loar, B. F. *Syntax, functional semantics, and referential semantics* 89
Norman, D. A. *Fodor's solipsisms: don't look a gift horse in the . . .* 90
Rey, G. *The formal and the opaque* 90
Rosenthal, D. M. *Methodological behaviorism: a case for transparent taxonomy* 92
Searle, J. R. *Two objections to methodological solipsism* 93
Shaw, R. and Turvey, M. T. *Methodological realism* 94
Smart, J. J. C. *Computational processes, representations and propositional attitudes* 97
Stich, S. P. *Paying the price for methodological solipsism* 97
Woodfield, A. *Methodological solipsism* 98

Authors' Response

Fodor, J. A. *Methodological solipsism: replies to commentators* 99

Target Article

Pylyshyn, Z. W. Computation and cognition: issues in the foundations of cognitive science **111**

Open Peer Commentary

Churchland, P. S. *Neuroscience and psychology: should the labor be divided?* 133
Churchland, P. M. *Plasticity: conceptual and neuronal* 133
Colby, K. M. *From computational metaphor to consensual algorithms* 134
Demopoulos, W. *A remark on the completeness of the computational model of mind* 135
Fortescue, M. *In defence of the armchair* 135
Grossberg, S. *Human and computer rules and representations are not equivalent* 136
Haugeland, J. *Psychology and computational architecture* 138
Heil, J. *Computation, cognition, and representation* 139
Hulse, S. H. *The reification of the mind-body problem?* 139
Hunt, E. *The borders of cognition* 140
Keil, F. *Reductionism and cognitive flexibility* 141
Klatzky, R. L. *The elusive visual processing mode: implications of the architecture/algorithm distinction* 142
Kyburg, H. E., Jr. *Functional architecture and free will* 143
Miller, G. A. *Computation, consciousness and cognition* 146
Miller, J. R. *Cognitive penetrability: let us not forget about memory* 146
Moore, R. C. *Criteria of cognitive impenetrability* 146
Pinker, S. *Explanations in theories of language and of imagery* 147
Powers, W. T. *Pylyshyn and perception* 148
Rey, G. *Penetrating the impenetrable* 149
Ringel, M. *Functional architecture and model validation* 150
Smythe, W. E. *Computation and symbolization* 151
Stich, S. P. *Computation without representation* 152
Weimer, W. B. *Cognition is not computation, for the reasons that computers don't solve the mind-body problems* 152
Zucker, S. W. *Functional architectures for cognition: are simple inferences possible?* 153

Author's Response

Pylyshyn, Z. W. *Cognitive representation and the process-architecture distinction* 154

Number 2, June 1980

Target Article

Symons, D. Précis: The evolution of human sexuality **171**

Open Peer Commentary

Alcock, J. *Beyond the sociobiology of sexuality: predictive hypotheses* 181
Bernstein, I. S. *Motives, intentions, science, and sex* 182
Dewsbury, D. A. *Methods in the two sociobiologies* 183
Diamond, M. *The biosocial evolution of human sexuality* 184
Eysenck, H. J. *Sociobiology – standing on one leg* 186
Geis, G. and Huston, T. L. *Forcible rape and human sexuality* 186
Ghiselin, M. T. *Is sex sufficient?* 187
Hailman, J. P. *Fitness, function, fidelity, fornication, and feminine philandering* 189
Heiman, J. R. *Selecting for a sociobiological fit* 189
Hoffman, M. R. *An interactionist perspective on human sexuality* 190
King, G. E. *Pair bonding and proximal mechanisms* 191
Lamb, M. E. *On the origins and implications of sex differences in human sexuality* 192
Lancaster, J. B. and Lancaster, C. S. *The division of labor and the evolution of human sexuality* 193
McGrew, W. C. *The proper study of sociobiological mankind is sex* 193
McGuinness, D. *Male and female choice in human sexuality* 194
Mitchell, G. *Sex differences and intent* 195
Ridley, M. *Konrad Lorenz and Humpty Dumpty: some ethology for Donald Symons* 196
Ruse, M. *Is science sexist?* 197
Sade, D. S. *Human sexuality: hints for an alternative explanation* 198
Steklis, H. D. *Problems of comparative primate sexuality* 199
Tennov, D. *The clarification of proximate mechanisms* 200
Tompkins, L. *An (im) printed circuit theory of sexual behavior* 200
Udry, J. R. *Female sexual adaptability: a consequence of the absence of natural selection among females* 201
Weitz, S. *Sex differences in sexuality: what is their relevance to sex roles?* 202
Whalen, R. E. *Evolutionary causation: how proximate is ultimate?* 202

Author's Response

Symons, D. *The evolution of human sexuality revisited* 203

Target Article

McGlone, J. Sex differences in human brain asymmetry: a critical survey 215

Open Peer Commentary

Annett, M. *Sex differences in laterality—meaningfulness versus reliability* 227
Beatty, W. W. *Sex differences in brain asymmetry: are there rodent models?* 228
Bener, A. *Sex differences: asymmetry in dermatoglyphics and brain* 228
Blinkov, S. *Sex differences, asymmetry, and variability* 229
Bradshaw, J. L. *Sex and side: a double dichotomy interacts* 229
Bryden, M. P. *Sex differences in brain organization: different brains or different strategies?* 230
Butler, S. *Sex differences in electrophysiological correlates of asymmetric cerebral function* 231
Denenberg, V. H. *Some principles for interpreting laterality differences* 232
Diamond, M. C. *New data supporting cortical asymmetry differences in males and females* 233
Dimond, S. J. *Sex differences in brain organization* 234
Fairweather, H. *Sex differences: still being dressed in the emperor's new clothes* 234
Flor-Henry, P. *Evolutionary and clinical aspects of lateralized sex differences* 235
Glick, S. D., Schonfeld, A. R., and Strumpf, A. J. *Sex differences in brain asymmetry of the rodent* 236
Harris, L. J. *Lateralized sex differences: substrates and significance* 236
Hier, D. B. and Kaplan, J. *Are sex differences in cerebral organization clinically significant?* 238
Hoyenga, K. B. *The puzzle of a sexually dimorphic brain* 239
Ingle, D. *Animal models for lateralized sex differences* 240
Kimura, D. *Sex differences in intrahemispheric organization of speech* 240
Kinsbourne, M. *If sex differences in brain lateralization exist, they have yet to be discovered* 241
Lansdell, H. *Man's skewed brain: factors and interests* 242
LeMay, M. *Sex differences in human brain morphology* 242
Martin, L. J. *Inadequate criteria for hypothesis testing in cerebral asymmetry research* 243
McGee, M. G. *The effect of brain asymmetry on cognitive functions depends upon what ability, for which sex, at what point in development* 243
McGuinness, D. *Strategies, demands, and lateralized sex differences* 244
Morgan, M. J. *Influences of sex on variation in human brain asymmetry* 244
Nottebohm, F. *A continuum of sexes bedevils the search for sexual differences?* 245
Ray, W. J. and Newcombe, N. *Interpreting sex differences in lateralization* 246
Rebert, C. S. *Sex differences in complex visuomotor coordination* 246
Sasanuma, S. *Do Japanese show sex differences in brain asymmetry? Supplementary findings* 247
Sherman, J. *Sex-related differences in functional human brain asymmetry: verbal function – no; spatial function – maybe* 248
Vandenberg, S. G. *Age effects in neurometrics* 249
Waber, D. P. *What is the significance of sex differences in performance asymmetries?* 249
Wolff, P. H. *A difference that may make no difference* 250

Author's Response

McGlone, J. *Sex differences in brain asymmetry survive peer commentary!* 251

Target Article

deCatanzaro, D. Human suicide: a biological perspective 265

Open Peer Commentary

Anisman, H. *Depression and suicide: stress as a precipitating factor* 272
Blanchard, D. C. *Biological variation and suicide* 273
Carr, E. G. *Suicide: comments on deCatanzaro's diathesis-stress model* 273
Dawkins, R. *Domesticity, senescence, and suicide* 274
Douglas, J. D. *Baechler's theory of suicide* 275
Duke, M. P. *Feasting on the sociobiology of suicide: somehow I still feel hungry . . .* 276
Farber, M. L. *Suicide as natural selection* 277
Frieden, G. *Self-destructive behavior: suicide, shocks and worms* 277
Hamilton, W. J. *Do nonhuman animals commit suicide?* 278
Hankoff, L. D. and Turner, W. J. *A nontheory of suicide* 279
Harmatz, M. G. *The biological perspective on suicide: to be or not to be – is that sociobiology?* 280
Lester, D. *The categorization of suicide* 281
Wenz, F. V. *Heredity, environment, and culture in suicide* 281
Wetzel, R. D. *Suicide: the need for a cognitive perspective* 282
Wilson, D. S. *Suicide, beanbag genetics, and pleiotropy* 283

Author's Response

deCatanzaro, D. *Human suicide: toward a diathesis-stress hypothesis* 283

Target Article

Bolles, R. C. and Fanselow, M. S. A perceptual-defensive-recuperative model of fear and pain **291**

Open Peer Commentary

Adams, D. B. *Motivational systems: fear or defense? pain or recuperation?* 301
Appley, M. H. *Stress and arousal in pain perception* 301
Bindra, D. *How are defensive and recuperative actions produced?* 302
Blanchard, D. C. and Blanchard, R. J. *PDR theory – a psychological approach to biological questions* 302
Bowsher, D. *Dual mechanism of pain* 303
Catania, A. C. *The explanation of motivation and the motivation of explanation* 304
Chapman, C. R. and Gagliardi, G. J. *Clinical implications of Bolles & Fanselow's pain/fear model* 305
Dubner, R. *Naloxone produces a fear and pain model* 306
Eichelman, B. *Fear and pain: semantic, biochemical and clinical reflections* 306
Eysenck, H. J. *Fear, pain, and arousal* 307
Fields, H. L. *Pain is sufficient to activate the endorphin-mediated analgesia system* 308
Fonberg, E. *Pain and fear are different motivations* 308
Gray, J. A. *On the difference between pain and fear* 310
Greenberg, G. *Premature theorizing is not always parsimonious* 310
Hayes, R. L. *The multiplicity of physiological and behavioral variables modulating pain responses* 311
Hendersen, R. W. *Motivation and function* 311
Jacquet, Y. F. *B-endorphin and ACTH: inhibitory and excitatory neurohormones of pain and fear?* 312
Melzack, R. *Pain theory: exceptions to the rule* 313
Miczek, K. A. *The neurochemistry of defensive behavior and fear* 313
Vierck, C. J. and Cooper, B. Y. *Contextual determinants of pain reactions* 314
Yaksh, T. L. *Role of the intrinsic modulatory systems in somesthesis* 315

Authors' Response

Bolles, R. C. and Fanselow, M. S. *PDR – a multi-level model of fear and pain* 315

Number 3, September 1980

Target Article

Jensen, A. R. Précis of *Bias in mental testing* **325**

Open Peer Commentary

Brace, C. L. *Social bias in mental testing* 333
Breland, H. M. *Population validity and admissions decisions* 334
Brody, N. and Brody, E. B. *Differential construct validity* 335
Cattell, R. B. *"They talk of some strict testing of us – Pish"* 336
Clarke, A. M. *Unbiased tests and biased people* 337
Dorfman, D. D. *Test bias: What did Yale, Harvard, Rolls-Royce, and a black have in common in 1917?* 339
Eckberg, D. L. *The problem of hierarchial thought in the work of Arthur Jensen* 340
Eckland, B. K. *Competent teachers and competent students* 341
Economos, J. *Bias cuts deeper than scores* 342
Gordon, R. A. *Implications of valid (and stubborn) IQ differences: An unstatesmanlike view* 343
Green, D. R. *Achievement test bias* 344
Harrington, G. M. *Criteria of test bias: do the statistical models fit reality?* 345
Havender, W. R. *Individual versus collective social justice* 345
Hirsch, J., Beeman, M. and Tully, T.P. *Compensatory education has succeeded* 346
Humphreys, L. G. *Intelligence testing: the importance of a difference should be evaluated independently of its causes* 347
Kempthorne, 0. and Wolins, L. *Controversies surrounding mental testing* 348
Kline, P. *Test bias and problems in cross-cultural testing* 349
Longstreth, L. E. *The definitive work on mental test bias* 350
Osborne, R. T. *The Spearman-Jensen hypothesis* 351
Reynolds, C. R. *In support of* Bias in Mental Testing *and scientific inquiry* 352
Rosenthal, R. *Error and bias in the selection of data* 352
Sternberg, R. J. *Intelligence and test bias: Art and science* 353
Tyler, L. E. *Tests are not to blame* 354
Vandenberg, S. G. *An existence proof for intelligence?* 355
Vernon P. E. *Antitest views are refuted* 356
Vetta, A. *Correlation, regression and biased science* 357
Vogel, F. *Genetic influence on IQ* 358
Wahlsten, D. *Race, the heritability of IQ, and the intellectual scale of nature* 358

Author's Response

Jensen, A. R. *Correcting the bias against mental testing: A preponderance of peer agreement* 359

Target Article

Ullman, S. Against direct perception 373

Open Peer Commentary

Braddick, O. J. *Direct perception: an opponent and a precursor of computational theories* 381
Bridgeman, B. *Direct perception and a call for primary perception* 382
Doner, J. F. and Lappin, J. S. *The function and process of perception* 383
Epstein, W. *Direct perception or mediated perception: a comparison of rival viewpoints* 384
Grossberg, S. *Direct perception or adaptive resonance?* 385
Gyr, J. W. *Visual perception is underdetermined by stimulation* 386
Hayes-Roth, F. *Mediating the so-called immediate processes of perception* 386
Hinton, G. E. *Inferring the meaning of direct perception* 387
Johansson, G., von Hofsten, C. and Jansson, G. *Direct perception and perceptual processes* 388
Jones, R. K. and Pick, A. D. *On the nature of information in behalf of direct perception* 388
Keyser, S. J. and Pinker, S. *Direct vs. representational views of cognition: A parallel between vision and phonology* 389
Koenderink, J. J. *Why argue about direct perception?* 390
Loftus, G. R. and Loftus, E. F. *Visual perception: the shifting domain of discourse* 391
Mace, W. M. *Perceptual activity and direct perception* 392
Mackworth, A. K. *Are mediating representations the ghosts in the machine?* 393
Prazdny, K. *How wrong is Gibson?* 394
Prindle, S. S., Carello, C., and Turvey, M. T. *Animal-environment mutuality and direct perception* 395
Reed, E. S. *Information pickup is the activity of perceiving* 397
Rock, I. *Difficulties with a direct theory of perception* 398
Runeson, S. *There is more to psychological meaningfulness than computation and representation* 399
Shaw, R. and Todd, J. *Abstract machine theory and direct perception* 400
Sloman, A. *What kind of indirect process is visual perception?* 401
von Fieandt, K. *In defense of invariances and higher-order stimuli* 404
Weimer, W. B. *Logical atomism and computation do not refute Gibson* 405
Welker, W. *Percepts, intervening variables, and neural mechanisms* 405
Zucker, S. W. *The computational/representational paradigm as normal science: further support* 406
Zuckerman, C. B. *What are the contributions of the direct perception approach?* 407

Authors' Response

Ullman, S. *Perception, information, and computation* 408

Target Article

Searle, J. R. Minds, brains, and programs 417

Open Peer Commentary

Abelson, R. P. *Searle's argument is just a set of Chinese symbols* 424
Block, N. *What intuitions about homunculi don't show* 425
Bridgeman, B. *Brains + programs = minds* 427
Danto, A. C. *The use and mention of terms and the simulation of linguistic understanding* 428
Dennett, D. *The milk of human intentionality* 428
Eccles, J. C. *A dualist-interactionist perspective* 430
Fodor, J. A. *Searle on what only brains can do* 431
Haugeland, J. *Programs, causal powers, and intentionality* 432
Hofstadter, D. R. *Reductionism and religion* 433
Libet, B. *Mental phenomena and behavior* 434
Lycan, W. G. *The functionalist reply (Ohio State)* 434
McCarthy, J. *Beliefs, machines, and theories* 435
Marshall, J. C. *Artificial intelligence—the real thing?* 435
Maxwell, G. *Intentionality: Hardware, not software* 437
Menzel, E. W. *Is the pen mightier than the computer?* 438
Minsky, M. *Decentralized minds* 439
Natsoulas, T. *The primary source of intentionality* 440
Puccetti, R. *The chess room: further demythologizing of strong AI* 441
Pylyshyn, Z. W. *The "causal power" of machines* 442
Rachlin, H. *The behaviorist reply (Stony Brook)* 444
Ringle, M. *Mysticism as a philosophy of artificial intelligence* 444
Rorty, R. *Searle and the special powers of the brain* 445
Schank, R. C. *Understanding Searle* 446
Sloman, A. and Croucher, M. *How to turn an information processor into an understander* 447
Smythe, W. E. *Simulation games* 448
Walter, D. O. *The thermostat and the philosophy professor* 449
Wilensky, R. *Computers, cognition and philosophy* 449

Author's Response

Searle, J. *Intrinsic intentionality* 450

Continuing Commentary on

Eysenck, H. J. (1979) The conditioning model of neurosis. BBS 2(2):155–99.

Ellis, A. *Some cognitive additions to Eysenck's "The conditioning model of neurosis"* 459
Freides, D. *Atavisms in psychopathological theory* 460
Kondas, O. *Human learning is more complex and fears are more influenced by ontogeny* 461
Pinkava, V. *A multivalued logical net modelling conditioning* 461
Pitman, R. K. *The conditioning model of neurosis: promise and limitations* 462

Author's Response

Eysenck, H. J. *Conditioning, cognition, and neurosis* 463

Toates, F. M. (1979) Homeostasis and drinking. BBS 2(1):95–136.

Bourbon, W. T. *Anticipatory regulation: a raincoat does not feedforward make* 465
Sinclair, J. D. *Compensatory behaviors and the "rest principle"* 466

Author's Response

Toates, F. M. *The modelling of incentive motivation processes* 466

Rosenthal, R. and Rubin, D. B. (1978) Interpersonal expectancy effects: the first 345 studies. BBS 1(3):377–415.

Clarke, A. M. *The interpersonal approach to expectancy effects: the experimenter and the subjects* 469
Darley, J. M. *Interpersonal expectancy effects: a future research agenda* 469
Masling, J. *On statistical stability and significance* 470
Peeters, G. *Social-cognitive factors in expectancy effects: why apples and oranges are fruits* 471
Rosenberg, M. J. *Experimenter expectancy, evaluation apprehension, and the diffusion of methodological angst* 472
Snyder, C. R. *Applying the self-fullfilling prophecy: some thoughts on how the prophet forms and sustains expectations* 474

Authors' Response

Rosenthal, R. and Rubin, D. B. *Further issues in summarizing 345 studies of interpersonal expectancy effects* 475

Corballis, M. C. and Morgan, M. J. (1978) On the biological basis of human laterality: I. Evidence for a maturational left-right gradient *and* II. The mechanisms of inheritance. BBS 1(2):261–336.

Hiscock, M. & Kinsbourne, M. *Is there a maturational left-right gradient for brain functions?* 477
Rife, D. C. *Laterality differences in twins* 477
von Kraft, A. *On the problem of the origin of asymmetric organs and human laterality* 478

Authors' Response

Corballis, M. C. *Human laterality: the other cheek* 479
Morgan, M. J. *On the problem of the origin of asymmetric organs and human laterality: a reply to von Kraft* 480

Number 4, December 1980

Target Article

Lynch, J. C. The functional organization of posterior parietal association cortex 485

Open Peer Commentary

Bisiach, E. *The compass of the parietal "command" system* 499
Butter, C. M. *Posterior parietal cortex: Unity or independence of functions?* 500
Chow, K. L. *Inner structure of cortical columns* 500
Deuel, R. K. *The parietal association fields and behavior* 501
Eidelberg, E. *Is the parietal lobe guilty of association?* 501
Ettlinger, G. *How can we resolve the enigma of parietal cortex?* 502
Glickstein, M. *Posterior parietal cortex and visual control of the hand* 503
Goldberg, M. E. and Robinson, D. L. *The significance of enhanced visual responses in posterior parietal cortex* 503
Heilman, K. M., Watson, R. T., Valenstein, E., and Bowers, D. *Neglect in man: Hemispheric asymmetries and hemispatial neglect* 505
Hyvärinen, J. *Sensorimotor interaction in parietal association cortext* 506
Jones, E. G. *Parietal cortex: Columns, connectivity, and convergence* 507
Latto, R. *Problems in comparing the behavioural effects of parietal cortex lesions in man and monkey and of integrating these with electrophysiological data* 508
Mansfield, R. J. W. *Global and local processing in the primate brain* 509
Mesulam, M-M. *An anatomical basis for the functional specialization of the parietal lobe in directed attention* 510
Pandya, D. N. and Seltzer, B. *Cortical connections and the functional organization of posterior parietal cortex* 511
Roland, P. E. *The posterior parietal association cortex in man* 513
Rolls, E. T., Perrett, D. and Thorpe, S. J. *The influence of motivation on the responses of neurons in the posterior parietal association cortex* 514
Sakata, H. *Reappraisal of the corollary discharge hypothesis* 515
Schlag, J. *Are parietal saccade neurons sensory or motor? Is the question worth asking?* 515
Stein, J. *A command or association function for the posterior parietal cortex?* 516

Thomas, R. K. *Attention, motivation and emotion: Entia non sunt multiplicanda praeter necessitatem* 517
Troost, B. T. *Clinical disorders of ocular motor control* 518
Weinstein, E. A. *Clinical features of hemi-inattention* 518
Mountcastle, V. B., Motter, B. C. and Andersen, R. A. *Some further observations on the functional properties of neurons in the parietal lobe of the waking monkey* 520

Author's Response

Lynch, J. C. *Parietal function: Different aspects of the unified whole* 523

Target Article

Selverston, A. I. Are central pattern generators understandable? 535

Open Peer Commentary

Ayers, J. *Do different behaviors require different central pattern generators?* 541
Block, G. D. *Snake oil and the modeling process in neurobiology* 541
Calabrese, R. L. *Invertebrate central pattern generators: modeling and complexity* 542
Cohen, A. H. *A new generation of experimental and theoretical methods is needed in neurobiology* 543
Davis, W. J. *Neurophilosophical reflections on central nervous pattern generators* 543
Delcomyn, F. *Even "simple" systems are more complex than we think* 544
Fentress, J. C. *Bursting networks* 545
Friesen, W. O. *Models, modeling, and the leech swimming rhythm* 546
Gerstein, G. L. *Models and multineuron recordings* 546
Getting, P. A. *Central pattern generators can be understood* 547
Gillette, R. *Adaptive significance, redundancy, and variance in central patterns generators* 547
Goldberg, L. J. *The failure of current strategies in the study of central pattern generators* 548
Grillner, S. *Can mammalian pattern generators be understood?* 549
Harth, E. *Must neural mechanisms be Newtonian?* 550
Hartline, D. K. *Roles for models in understanding neural networks* 551
Hoyle, G. *Expectation and achievement in analysis of motor program generation* 552
Huber, F. *Central pattern generators (CPGs) from the viewpoint of a behavioral physiologist* 553
Kaneko, C. R. S. *A practical approach to understanding central pattern generators* 554
Larimer, J. L. and Thompson, W. *Pessimism, models, and episodic behavior* 554
Lent, C. M. *On neuronal nihilism* 555
Loeb, G. E. and Marks, W. B. *Epistemology and heuristics in neural network research* 556
Luco, J. V. *Central pattern generators and sensory input* 557
Merickel, M. *Single-cell versus network properties and the use of models* 557
Moffett, S. *The comparative approach to understanding central pattern generators* 558
Pentreath, V. W. *At what level will pattern generators be understood?* 559
Pinsker, H. M. *Neuroethological analysis of central pattern generators* 559
Reingold, S. C. and Gelperin, A. *Central pattern generators and neuroethology* 560
Rowell H. F. *Philosophy leads to pessimism, research to understanding* 561
Székely, G. *Particulars and principles of nervous activity* 562
Weeks, J. C. *The implications of recent experimental results for the validity of modeling studies of the leech swim central pattern generator* 562
Wendler, G. *On the history and value of the central pattern generator concept* 563
Wiens, T. J. *Graded transmission, mechanistic multiplicity, and modeling* 563
Willows, A. O. D. *Central pattern generator analysis is alive and well* 564

Author's Response

Selverston, A. I. *Toward understanding central pattern generators* 565

Target Article

Sternberg, R. J. Sketch of a componential subtheory of human intelligence 573

Open Peer Commentary

Berry, J. W. *Cultural universality of any theory of human intelligence remains an open question* 584
Borkowski, J. G. *On the nature and measurement of metacomponents* 585
Brody, N. *Components to the rescue* 586
Butterfield, E. C. *On Sternberg's translation of g into metacomponents and on questions of parsimony* 586
Carroll, J. B. *Components and factors: Complementary "units" of analysis?* 587
Collins, A. *A cognitive scientist's view of intelligence* 588
Detterman, D. K. *Understand cognitive components before postulating metacomponents* 589
Frederiksen, J. R. *A Thurstonian's reaction to a componential theory of intelligence* 590
Guilford, J. P. *Components versus factors* 591
Hunt, E. *The language of componential analysis* 592
Keating, D. P. *Sternberg's sketchy theory: Defining details desired* 595

Kline, P. *Factors or processes in intelligence* 596
Lansdell, H. *Intelligence: Toward a modern sketch of a good g* 597
MacLeod, C. M. *Discovering and training the components of intelligence* 597
Pellegrino, J. W. *Three perspectives on intelligence* 598
Royce, J. R. *On theory and metatheory, and normal and revolutionary science* 599

Author's Response

Sternberg, R. J. *Claims, counterclaims, and components: A countercritique of componential analysis* 599

Continuing Commentary

Premack, D. and Woodruff, G. (1978) Does the chimpanzee have a theory of mind? BBS 1:515–26.

Griffin, D. R. (1978) Prospects for a cognitive ethology. BBS 1:527–38.

Savage-Rumbaugh, E.S., Rumbaugh, D.M., and Boysen, S. (1978) Linguistically mediated tool use and exchange by chimpanzees (*Pan troglodytes*). BBS 1:539–54.

Lindauer, M. *Cognition and consciousness – their evolutionary gradients* 615
Schwartz, R. *How rich a theory of mind?* 616
Shanon, B. *The significance of self-awareness* 618

Authors' Responses

Griffin, D. R. *What do animals think?* 618
Savage-Rumbaugh, S., Scanlon, J. L., and Rumbaugh, D. M. *Communicative intentionality in the chimpanzee* 620

Eibl-Eibesfeldt, I. (1979) Human ethology: concepts and implications for the sciences of man. BBS 2:1–57.

Bekoff, M. *Human ethology, biological determinism, directive genes, and trees* 623
Bubenik, A. B. *On demographic factors and neurohormonal substrates* 624
Harrington, G. M. *Locus of causation: analysis of ethological similarities* 625
Markl, H. S. *How much can the ethological approach contribute to an understanding of human behavior?* 626
Pitman, R. K. *Austro-German ethology and schizophrenia* 627
Sapolsky, R. and Eichenbaum, H. *Still-life photographs: The power of human ethology in the explanation of human behavior* 628
Simons, R. C. *Eibl-Eibesfeldt's human ethology: The problem of evidence* 629
Wassermann, G. D. *A critique of some aspects of human ethology* 630

Author's Response

Eibl-Eibesfeldt, I. *Jumping on the sociobiology bandwagon* 631